

ITEM #:	<u>1</u>
DATE:	<u>04-15-25</u>
DEPT:	<u>P&R</u>

COUNCIL ACTION FORM

SUBJECT: ADA HAYDEN HERITAGE PARK TRAIL REPLACEMENT PROJECT

BACKGROUND:

The Ada Hayden Heritage Park Trail Replacement Project includes replacing the current ten foot wide asphalt path with a twelve foot wide concrete path. The trail is being replaced due to sloughing and breaking of the edges, tree roots growing into the asphalt, excessive cracking, settling of the path, drainage issues in areas, and the width not meeting the needs of users.

The decision to replace asphalt with concrete is based on the reasons below:

- **Durability** - Concrete is more durable than asphalt as it is a harder material.
- **Longevity** - Concrete is estimated to last 30+ years. The current path is needing replacement after 20 years and has already overlays in several areas.
- **Long-Term Maintenance** - Concrete will reduce long-term maintenance costs as the issues being experienced with asphalt will be eliminated or minimized. The overlays needed on the current path have cost over \$50,000 which would not be needed with concrete.
- **Cost Effectiveness** - Concrete is more cost effective than asphalt as the two materials are similar in costs, however, concrete is more durable and has a longer life expectancy.
- **Trail Material Trends** - The City is replacing asphalt shared use paths with concrete for the aforementioned reasons. Story County Conservation has recently paved the Heart of Iowa Trail with concrete as well.
- **Safety** - Due to the reasons stated, concrete will provide a safer surface than asphalt.

Staff understands that concrete is not the best surface for runners, however, concrete is the best surface for a majority of users.

The compatibility of multiple users (i.e. pedestrians, bicyclists, rollerbladers, etc.) is a concern and changes to the existing park rules and ordinances are being explored by the Parks and Recreation Commission to improve the interaction. Recommendations from the Commission will be brought before the City Council for consideration at a future meeting.

At its January 14, 2025 meeting, Council awarded a contract to WHKS to develop plans and specifications for this project. WHKS has conducted a survey of the trail, as well as, walked the trail with staff and two members of the Friends of Ada Hayden Heritage Park. Based on the information gathered, WHKS has developed preliminary plans and cost opinion for the trail replacement.

TRAIL REPLACEMENT OPTIONS:

WHKS has been exploring two replacement options for this project; 1) Close the entire trail during construction, and 2) Close the trail in phases during construction. Each of these options include milling the existing path with the material left on the trail for use as the sub-base, compacting the sub-base, installing the concrete path, backfilling along the edges of the new surface, and seeding the disturbed areas.

The base bid for this project will include the loop around both lakes and the trail section from the Harrison Parking Lot to the main trail. The repaving of the Edgewater Court, Fletcher, and Stone Brooke connectors will be bid as an alternate. Please note that with both these options, the Upland Trail will not be paved and remain mostly open.

OPTION 1 - CLOSE THE ENTIRE TRAIL DURING CONSTRUCTION

With this option, the contractor and its subs can start the project and work through to completion without interruption. Once the existing path is being milled, a crew can be compacting the sub-base, another crew can then start paving, and finally a crew can be backfilling. Once the project is underway, multiple crews can be working simultaneously to complete the project without interruptions. **Each crew can mobilize one time which is estimated to save a significant amount of money and time.**

Even though the entire trail would be closed to start the project, staff will have discussions at the pre-bid and pre-construction meetings to educate the successful bidder of the importance of opening a section of the trail (i.e. north or south lake loop) prior to the entire project being completed.

WHKS has been talking to potential contractors and the feedback received is that this option is preferred because once the crews are on site, they can start and finish the project without delays, except for weather. One contractor reviewed the plans and provided the following information related to this option if they were to bid today:

Base Bid Price	\$1,100,000
Time to Complete Project	5 - 6 Weeks

OPTION 2 - CLOSE THE TRAIL IN PHASES DURING CONSTRUCTION

This option would complete the trail in phases and would require construction crews to start and stop their work multiple times increasing the costs associated with the need to mobilize several times. Whenever crews are removed from the job, there is also the risk that they start another job and may not be able to get back to this project when needed thus delaying the project. The upside of this option is that a portion of the trail will always be open. **However, potential contractors indicated this option would be bid 20-30% higher and take 50% longer to complete the project. The impact of these increases is shown below:**

Base Bid Price	\$1,320,000 - \$1,430,000
Time to Complete Project	7.5 - 9 Weeks

FUNDING:

City Council has approved \$1,400,000 for this project. The table below shows the funding available as well and cost estimates for each of the two options. The higher end of the range for Option 2 is being used to reflect the worst case scenario.

Item	Option 1	Option 2
Funding Available	\$1,400,000	\$1,400,000
Expenses:		
Base Bid Estimate	\$1,100,000	\$1,430,000
Alternate Estimate	\$100,000	\$100,000
Engineering Services	\$88,600	\$88,600
Total Expenses	\$1,288,600	\$1,618,600
Funding Surplus or (Shortfall)	\$111,400	(\$218,600)

ALTERNATIVES:

1. Direct staff to bid the Ada Hayden Heritage Park Trail Replacement Project to include the closing of the trail during construction.
2. Direct staff to bid the Ada Hayden Heritage Park Trail Replacement Project to include the closing of the trail in phases during construction.
3. Refer back to staff.

CITY MANAGER'S RECOMMENDED ACTION:

Ada Hayden Heritage Park is used by many people for walking, biking, dog walking, rollerblading, and other activities. Due to this heavy use and the condition of the path, the safety of all users is in question and this project will help address these concerns. The path will be two feet wider than the current path and the concrete will provide a smoother, more durable, and long-lasting surface than asphalt.

Staff continues to look for ways to accomplish projects in the most cost-effective way possible yet still provide as few inconveniences as possible to the users. There are two options presented in this report for City Council to consider.

Option 1 is estimated to be the most cost-effective option which could result in savings to the budget. The project can also be completed in 5-6 weeks with one loop of trail potentially opening prior to the completion of the entire trail.

Option 2 will keep portions of the trail open after construction begins, however, the project could take 9 weeks to complete, and it is estimated there would not be enough funding available for this project to even complete the base bid, much less the alternate. Staff has not yet identified additional funding at this time to cover the shortfall presented in Option 2.

Both options will inconvenience users in different ways with Option 1 having the shortest completion time. Fortunately, there are many wonderful trails within the park system that users

can utilize while this project is being completed. Contractors have indicated this work could be done in the fall of 2025 and Option 1 presents a cost-effective way to accomplish all components with the allocated funding available. Therefore, it is the recommendation of the City Manager that the City Council approve Alternative 1 as stated above.