

**COUNCIL ACTION FORM**

**SUBJECT: RESCIND AWARD TO WRIGHT TREE SERVICE, INC., AND AWARD CONTRACT TO ASPLUNDH TREE EXPERT CO. FOR FY2009-10 LINE CLEARANCE PROGRAM**

**BACKGROUND:**

On June 9, 2009, City Council awarded a contract to Wright Tree Service, Inc. for the FY2009-10 Line Clearance Program for the Electric Distribution Division. Payments under this contract would be calculated on unit prices bid for actual work performed. The cost evaluation is based on the unit prices for a crew of four people and equipment for 48 weeks per year.

After award of this contract an error was discovered on Attachment B of the bid evaluation. This attachment contained the three-year cost evaluation of the bids received from the two prequalified companies. The three-year cost was used to determine the overall low bidder. Unfortunately, the headers which contained the bidders' names were transposed and as a result Wright Tree Service, Inc. was mistakenly awarded the contract based on Asplundh Tree Expert Co.'s pricing. Asplundh Tree Expert Co. is the actual low bidder.

Both companies have been informed of the error and the subsequent recommendation to the Council to rescind the original award to Wright Tree Service, and to award a contract to the actual low bidder, Asplundh Tree Expert Company. Asplundh is the current provider of tree trimming services to the Electric Utility, and has provided the City with acceptable service over the period of the current contract.

**ALTERNATIVES:**


- 1) Rescind award of contract to Wright Tree Service, Inc., Des Moines, IA, and award the contract to the actual low bidder, Asplundh Tree Expert Co., Fairfax, IA, for the 2009-10 Line Clearance Program at the hourly rates and unit prices bid, in an amount not to exceed \$270,100, with renewal options for 2010-11 and 2011-12.
- 2) Do not rescind the previous award and proceed with a contract with Wright Tree Service, Inc., the second low bidder. The difference in the contracts between the Asplundh and Wright bids is only \$1,978 in the first year and \$3,997 over the three years of the proposal.

**MANAGER'S RECOMMENDED ACTION:**


An error on the bid report resulted in an award to Wright Tree Service, Inc., the apparent low bidder based on the previous analysis. Asplundh Tree Expert Company was the actual low bidder. Asplundh has previously been awarded this contract and has a solid record of safety and professionalism while working for the City of Ames.

Therefore, it is the recommendation of the City Manager that the City Council adopt Alternative No. 1, rescinding award of this contract to Wright Tree Service, Inc., Des Moines, IA, and awarding the contract to Asplundh Tree Expert Co., Fairfax, IA, for the 2009-10 Line Clearance Program at the hourly rates and unit prices bid, in an amount not to exceed \$270,100. The contract will also contain renewal options for 2010-11 and 2011-12.

**CITY OF AMES, IOWA  
LINE CLEARANCE PROGRAM  
FY 2009-2010**

	ASPLUNDH TREE EXPERT COMPANY FAIRFAX, IOWA		WRIGHT TREE SERVICE DES MOINES, IOWA	
	HOURLY RATE		HOURLY RATE	
LABOR DESCRIPTION	STRAIGHT TIME	TIME & ONE-HALF	STRAIGHT TIME	TIME & ONE-HALF
Working Foreman	\$29.86	\$41.32	\$29.75	\$39.84
Trimmer A	\$26.83	\$36.97	\$27.54	\$36.78
Trimmer B	\$25.80	\$35.50	\$25.09	\$33.38
Trimmer C	\$23.73	\$32.52	\$23.84	\$31.64
Trimmer D	\$22.31	\$30.49	\$22.61	\$29.94
Ground Person	\$19.78	\$26.86	\$18.95	\$24.86
Line Permitter	\$26.83	\$36.97	\$27.54	\$36.78
EQUIPMENT DESCRIPTION	RATE PER CREW HOUR		RATE PER CREW HOUR	
Hydraulic aerial device	\$11.50		\$11.55	
Manual aerial device	\$11.50		\$11.55	
Chip truck	\$5.44		\$7.25	
Brush Tractor	\$30.90		\$34.25	
Truck&Trailer for Brush trac.	\$8.14		\$11.27	
Hydro Axe	\$46.35		\$57.42	
Truck&Trailer for Hydro Axe.	\$8.14		\$11.27	
Pick-up Truck	\$7.50		\$8.05	
Power saw	\$0.53		\$0.45	
Brush Chipper	\$4.07		\$4.10	
Hand pruning equip.	\$0.00		\$0.00	
Ropes and body belts	\$0.00		\$0.00	
MATERIALS & SUPPLIES	BID PRICE		BID PRICE	
Banvel CST per gal	\$33.50			
Garlon 4 per gal	\$37.00		\$35.34	
Tree Paint: Maintain A per case of 12 13 Oz.cans	\$43.00		\$59.28	
Other supplies Cost plus %	10.0%		10.0%	
PERCENTAGE OF INCREASE, OPTIONAL RENEWAL PERIODS				
Labor FY 2010-2011	2.00%		2.00%	
Labor FY 2011-2012	3.00%		2.00%	
Equipment FY 2011-2012	3.00%		3.00%	

CITY OF AMES, IOWA  
 LINE CLEARANCE PROGRAM  
 FY 2009 THROUGH FY 2012

	ASPLUNDH TREE EXPERT COMPANY FAIRFAX, IOWA					
	HOURLY RATE		RENEWAL PERIOD RATES			
	STRAIGHT TIME	TIME & ONE-HALF	FY 10-11		FY 11-12	
Working Foreman	\$29.86	\$41.32	\$30.46	\$42.15	\$31.37	\$43.41
Trimmer A	\$26.83	\$36.97	\$27.37	\$37.71	\$28.19	\$38.84
Trimmer B	\$25.80	\$35.50	\$26.32	\$36.21	\$27.11	\$37.30
Trimmer C	\$23.73	\$32.52	\$24.20	\$33.17	\$24.93	\$34.17
Trimmer D	\$22.31	\$30.49	\$22.76	\$31.10	\$23.44	\$32.03
Ground Person	\$19.78	\$26.86	\$20.18	\$27.40	\$20.78	\$28.22
Line Permitter	\$26.83	\$36.97	\$27.37	\$37.71	\$28.19	\$38.84
<b>EQUIPMENT DESCRIPTION</b>						
	<b>RATE PER CREW HOUR</b>					
Hydraulic aerial device	\$11.50				\$11.85	
Manual aerial device	\$11.50				\$11.85	
Chip truck	\$5.44				\$5.60	
Brush Tractor	\$30.90				\$31.83	
Truck&Trailer for Brush trac.	\$8.14				\$8.38	
Hydro Axe	\$46.35				\$47.74	
Truck&Trailer for Hydro Axe.	\$8.14				\$8.38	
Pick-up Truck	\$7.50				\$7.73	
Power saw	\$0.53				\$0.55	
Brush Chipper	\$4.07				\$4.19	
Hand pruning equip.	\$0.00				\$0.00	
Ropes and body belts	\$0.00				\$0.00	
<b>MATERIALS &amp; SUPPLIES</b>						
	<b>BID PRICE</b>					
Banvel CST per gal	\$33.50					
Garlon 4 per gal	\$37.00				\$38.11	
Tree Paint: Maintain A per case of 12 13 Oz.cans	\$43.00				\$44.29	
Other supplies Cost plus %	10.0%					
<b>PERCENTAGE OF INCREASE, OPTIONAL RENEWAL PERIODS</b>						
Labor FY 2010-2011	2.00%					
Labor FY 2011-2012	3.00%					
Equipment FY 2011-2012	3.00%					

**ATTACHMENT B****CITY OF AMES, IOWA  
EVALUATED TOTAL COST  
LINE CLEARANCE PROGRAM FY2009-FY2012**

<b>DESCRIPTION</b>	<b>ASPLUNDH TREE EXPERT CO</b>	<b>WRIGHT TREE SERVICE, INC</b>
<b>FY 2009-2010:</b>		
Estimated Total Labor Costs	\$198,336.00	\$199,257.60
Estimated Total Equipment Costs	<u>\$45,312.00</u>	<u>\$46,368.00</u>
<b>Estimated Total Costs FY 2009-2010</b>	<b>\$243,648.00</b>	<b>\$245,625.60</b>
<b>FY 2010-2011:</b>		
Estimated Total Labor Costs	\$202,302.72	\$203,242.75
Estimated Total Equipment Costs	<u>\$45,312.00</u>	<u>\$46,368.00</u>
<b>Estimated Total Costs FY 2010-2011</b>	<b>\$247,614.72</b>	<b>\$249,610.75</b>
<b>FY 2011-2012:</b>		
Estimated Total Labor Costs	\$208,371.80	\$207,307.61
Estimated Total Equipment Costs	<u>\$46,671.36</u>	<u>\$47,759.04</u>
<b>Estimated Total Costs FY 2011-2012</b>	<b>\$255,043.16</b>	<b>\$255,066.65</b>
<b>TOTAL EVALUATED COST, THREE YEARS</b>	<b>\$746,305.88</b>	<b>\$750,303.00</b>