

COUNCIL ACTION FORM

SUBJECT: POWER PLANT UNIT #8 BOILER REPAIR PROJECT – REPORT OF BIDS

BACKGROUND:

On August 25, 2020, the City Council approved plans and specifications for the Unit 8 Boiler Repair Project. This project, which has been planned for several years, is to repair the boiler through the following actions:

- Replacing the waterwall tube stubs in the lower section of the boiler
- Replacing all the pendant tubes in the superheat section
- Modifying the boiler as per the original equipment manufacturers (OEM) recommendation

Bid documents were issued to thirty-seven firms and five plan rooms. The bid was advertised on the Current Bid Opportunities section of the Purchasing webpage and a Legal Notice was published on the websites of a contractor plan room service with statewide circulation and the Iowa League of Cities.

On October 14, 2020, seven bids were received as shown on the attached summary.

The Engineer's cost estimate for this project is \$8,574,000. The approved Capital Improvements Plan (CIP) includes \$6,550,000 for the Unit 8 Boiler Repair Project. The project in its entirety consists of five (5) work elements. Three of the five elements are deemed urgent and critical. The Engineer's estimate for the critical three elements is \$5,278,000, \$1,272,000 less than budget. The three critical elements include 1) Waterwall Ribbon, 2) Replace Secondary Superheater tubes, 3) Boiler Modifications per the OEM. The other two elements, estimated to cost an additional \$3,296,000 are needed and important, but can be deferred. if necessary. These two elements include the Primary Superheater and the Radiant Superheater sections. Because it is staff's desire that the bids would be such that all elements of the project can be undertaken without deferring, these two elements were bid as alternates to determine if there are sufficient funds to proceed with more than the three elements.

Staff feels that additional time is needed to evaluate each bid in order to recommend an award that best meets the City's needs.

ALTERNATIVES:

1. Accept the report of bids and delay award for the Unit 8 Boiler Repair Project until staff is able to perform a thorough review and determine a recommended company to award the contract to.
2. Award a contract to the apparent low bid.
3. Award a contract to one of the other companies that submitted a bid.
4. Reject all bids, which will delay this project.

CITY MANAGER'S RECOMMENDED ACTION:

This project should substantially address Unit 8's boiler tube failures. By delaying award of this bid, staff will have adequate time to fully evaluate each bid before recommending action by the City Council.

Therefore, it is the recommendation of the City Manager that the City Council adopt Alternative No. 1 as stated above.



ITB 2021-005 UNIT 8 BOILER REPAIR BID SUMMARY

BIDDER: HELFRICH BROTHERS BOILER WORKS INC, LAWRENCE, MA

	Base Bid	Alternate 1	Alternate 2	Alternate 3
PRICE	\$7,846,126.21	\$7,237,831.65	\$5,045,274.59	\$4,377,980.03
Sales Taxes Included in above amount	\$549,228.84	\$506,648.22	\$353,169.22	\$306,458.60
EVALUATED AMOUNT:	\$8,395,355.05	\$7,744,479.87	\$5,398,443.81	\$4,684,438.63
Lead time ARO to source tubes (weeks)	6-10 weeks	6-10 weeks	6-10 weeks	6-10 weeks
Total project time ARO (weeks)	34 weeks	34 weeks or less	34 weeks or less	34 weeks or less
Source of Tubes	Domestic and/or Foreign - Europe	Domestic and/or Foreign - Europe	Domestic and/or Foreign - Europe	Domestic and/or Foreign - Europe

BIDDER: TEI CONSTRUCTION SERVICES INC., DUNCAN, SC

	Base Bid	Alternate 1	Alternate 2	Alternate 3
PRICE	\$6,650,364	\$5,855,964	\$4,676,411	\$3,882,011
Sales Taxes Included in above amount	\$39,907	\$35,140	\$28,062	\$23,295
EVALUATED AMOUNT:	\$6,690,271	\$5,891,104	\$4,704,473	\$3,905,306
Lead time ARO to source tubes (weeks)	5-8 weeks	5-8 weeks	5-8 weeks	5-8 weeks
Total project time ARO (weeks)	34 weeks	34 weeks	34 weeks	33 weeks
Source of Tubes	Domestic	Domestic	Domestic	Domestic

BIDDER: THOMPSON CONSTRUCTION GROUP, INC., SUMTER, SC

	Base Bid	Alternate 1	Alternate 2	Alternate 3
PRICE	\$8,729,809	\$7,657,470	\$6,429,918	\$5,372,634
Sales Taxes Included in above amount	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0
EVALUATED AMOUNT:	\$8,729,809	\$7,657,470	\$6,429,918	\$5,372,634
Lead time ARO to source tubes (weeks)	8 weeks	8 weeks	8 weeks	8 weeks
Total project time ARO (weeks)	34 weeks	34 weeks	33 weeks	33 weeks
Source of Tubes	Domestic	Domestic	Domestic	Domestic
Deduct using Inconel 625	-\$124,000.00	-\$109,000.00	-\$78,000.00	-\$63,000.00

BIDDER: AZZ SMS LLC, SAINT PETERSBURG, FL

	Base Bid	Alternate 1	Alternate 2	Alternate 3
PRICE	\$9,775,245	\$8,822,203	\$7,187,079	\$6,164,340
Sales Taxes Included in above amount	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0
EVALUATED AMOUNT:	\$9,775,245	\$8,822,203	\$7,187,079	\$6,164,340
Lead time ARO to source tubes (weeks)	46 weeks	40 weeks	33 weeks	25 weeks
Total project time ARO (weeks)	51 weeks	45 weeks	38 weeks	30 weeks
Source of Tubes	Domestic	Domestic	Domestic	Domestic

BIDDER: ENERFAB POWER & INDUSTRIAL, KANSAS CITY, MO

	Base Bid	Alternate 1	Alternate 2	Alternate 3
--	----------	-------------	-------------	-------------

PRICE	\$8,649,782	\$7,669,223	\$6,121,265	\$5,215,776
Sales Taxes Included in above amount	\$430,209	\$360,226	\$262,892	\$206,382
EVALUATED AMOUNT:	\$9,079,991	\$8,029,449	\$6,384,157	\$5,422,158
Lead time ARO to source tubes (weeks)	46 weeks	40 weeks	33 weeks	25 weeks
Total project time ARO (weeks)	51 weeks	45 weeks	38 weeks	30 weeks
Source of Tubes	Domestic	Domestic	Domestic	Domestic
BIDDER: A&D CONSTRUCTORS, LLC, EVANSVILLE IN				
	Base Bid	Alternate 1	Alternate 2	Alternate 3
PRICE	\$9,589,573.54	\$8,421,254	\$6,554,693	\$5,483,509
Sales Taxes Included in above amount	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0
EVALUATED AMOUNT:	\$9,589,573.54	\$8,421,254	\$6,554,693	\$5,483,509
Lead time ARO to source tubes (weeks)	46 weeks	40 weeks	33 weeks	25 weeks
Total project time ARO (weeks)	54 weeks	48 weeks	39 weeks	31 weeks
Source of Tubes	Domestic	Domestic	Domestic	Domestic
BIDDER: FRANK LILL & SON, INC., VICTOR NY				
	Base Bid	Alternate 1	Alternate 2	Alternate 3
PRICE	\$8,248,337	\$7,749,337	\$7,149,337	\$6,549,337
Sales Taxes Included in above amount	\$50,000	\$50,000	\$50,000	\$50,000
EVALUATED AMOUNT:	\$8,298,337	\$7,799,337	\$7,199,337	\$6,599,337
Lead time ARO to source tubes (weeks)	24 Weeks	24 Weeks	24 Weeks	24 Weeks
Total project time ARO (weeks)	34 weeks	34 weeks	34 weeks	34 weeks
Source of Tubes	Unknown	Unknown	Unknown	Unknown